

MINUTES

Historic Preservation Commission
7447 E. Indian School Road
First Floor Community Development Conference Room
April 8, 2004
5:00 P.M.

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair
B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair
Nancy Dallett, Commissioner
George Hartz, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner
Cathy Johnson, Commissioner
Paul Winslow, Commissioner

Staff: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele, HPO

Visitors: Janie Ellis, Joanna Hopkins, Brad Carr, and Claudio Munoz W.

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members and staff present as stated above.

MINUTES

Commissioner Johnson requested corrections to the March 11, 2004 minute. On page 3, last paragraph, the word tours should be changed to tour. On page 3, under the motion for collection on Main Street. Commission Winslow should be changed to Commissioner Winslow. On Page 4, that reads: "Commissioner Hartz stated the Committee gave some consideration if it was practical to..." should be changed to: Commissioner Hartz stated the Committee gave some consideration to see if it was practical to..." On page 5, sentence that reads: "Chair Wimmer reported that he attended the East Valley Coalition meeting on February 24th, at Monti's in Tempe." She stated that Commissioner Hartz also attended the meeting so that should be added.

Commissioner Winslow made a motion to approve the minutes of the March 11, 2004 meeting as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hartz and passed unanimously by a vote of seven (7) to zero (0).

Chair Wimmer reported the Work Session item for the Hotel Valley Ho Historic Property has been pulled from the agenda at the owner's request.

PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS

1-HP-2004 Cattle Track Complex Certification of Appropriateness (Cattle Track Complex Historic Property) – request by Janie Ellis, owner/applicant to approve relocating two residential structures, totaling 2,530 square feet area, to two pad sites identified on the approved site plan for historic property located at 6105 N. Cattle Track Road, zoned Special Campus, Historic Property (SR HP). The Commission will use the design guidelines from the approved Historic Preservation Plan and the site approved by City Council in case 35-ZN-1995#4 for this property to determine whether the requested Certification of Appropriateness should be approved.

Ms. Abele presented this case as per the staff report. Staff recommends approval of the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans and design to relocate two residential structures to pad locations identified on the approved site because the application is consistent with the design guidelines in the Cattle Track Complex Historic Preservation Plan.

Janie Ellis, 6105 N. Cattle Track Road, stated the Ellis Family would like to try and move an adobe house and redwood guesthouse at the southwest corner of Cattle Track and Lincoln Drive. The houses were designed and built by George Ellis in the 1940's. She commented that the house was lived in by one of the sculptors of Mt. Rushmore. The lot has been approved for a rezoning and the owners are requiring her to move the structures by the end of May 2004 or they will be demolished. She further stated that they want to move the structures to 105 Cattle Track, which is zoned Special Campus Historic Property (SC HP).

She reported this will be a delicate endeavor and the moving company is not sure all pieces will survive the move intact. They think the move will be in four sections. She plans to restore the buildings and make them an integral part of the property.

Commissioner Howard reported that she was out on the property today and noticed trenches in that area and inquired if they are planned for footings. Ms. Ellis replied the trenches are for phone lines and they need to be moved.

Commissioner Winslow commented that these are older buildings that are coming into a setting that is an established historic setting. He inquired if there was going to be a designation to the fact that these are being added. Ms. Abele provided a brief overview of the process. Several structures on the property are currently listed in the designation report as contributing to the historic character. She noted that once the building is sited it would come back to the Commission to determine if it is a contributing element to the historic property designation.

Commissioner Gonzales stated for the record he lives across from the subject property and a section of his fence would be taken down to accommodate the move but there would be no remuneration.

Commissioner Dallett inquired how they would be able to minimize the impact of the placement of this structure through screening and landscaping. Ms. Ellis stated they would continue to plant more trees noting that the placement would be difficult to see from the road. Commissioner Dallett inquired how the scale would fit in with the horizontal and low line of the existing buildings. Ms. Ellis replied it would be the same. Mr. Meserve noted the site plan the City Council approved says 18 feet between the street so they are under 18 feet.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that he was very familiar with the subject property and felt it would fit in with the recurrent themes already established on the property.

Commissioner Hartz stated that he did not understand the second to last sentence from Ms. Ellis' letter that reads: "When the move is complete and we know the exact square footage it should be deducted from the total square footage allow on our site". He inquired what that statement refers to. Ms. Ellis stated they did not say the exact square footage because they don't know how much of the building they would be able to move because portions may fall apart. She further stated that they are allowed 85,000 square feet of building in the designated area.

Mr. Meserve inquired if Ms. Ellis has had any feedback from neighbors and the public after this site was posted. Ms. Ellis reported that everyone has been enthusiastic and hopes that it works.

Chair Wimmer noted for the record that there was not public comment on this request.

Commissioner Dallett moved approval of the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans and design to relocate two residential structures to pad locations identified on the approved site because the application is consistent with the design guidelines in the Cattle Track Complex Historic Preservation Plan. The relevant design guidelines seem to be well in hand and according to the ability to match the visual appearance, the height, building materials, the visual appearance of new construction from the public rights of way will be minimized through a variety of techniques such as landscape and placement. Approval is subject to the following added provision:

The entire building must be moved to the site and the applicant return to the Commission if the move creates a situation where they cannot move the entire building.

Commissioner Johnson stated the way the motion was stated approval is contingent upon moving the entire building. Ms. Abele stated the Commission is only being asked for the relocation and once it is moved there would need to be analysis of what work needs to be done. There may be some non-contributing elements.

Commissioner Dallett amended her motion to strike the added provision that the entire building must be moved to the site and the applicant return to the Commission if the move creates a situation where they cannot move the entire building. Second by Commissioner Hartz.

Commissioner Johnson stated that she felt the property does meet the design guidelines and the building was designed and built by George Ellis and does fit in with the compound where it is being moved and does have the materials and the elements match.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that he would like to commend the applicant on their efforts to save this historic property.

Chairman Wimmer called for the vote. The motion passed by a vote of seven (7) to zero (0).

20-ZN-2003/6HP-2003, Sugar Bowl Historic Property Overlay: request by the City of Scottsdale, applicant, Jaclyn H. Krawczyk, Margery H. Morton, Frederick R. Huntress, and Northern Trust Bank, N.A., Trustee, owners to rezone from Central Business District Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO) to Central Business, Downtown Overlay Historic Property (C-2 DO HP) on .13± acre parcel located at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road.

Chairman Wimmer noted that there was an error in the legal posting so the Commission is required to hear cases 20-ZN-2003/6-HP-3003 and 19-ZN-2003/5-HP-2003 again.

Ms. Abele passed out a copy of the presentation that will be given to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Meserve stated that, when these two cases were heard at the February 12, 2004 Historic Preservation Commission meeting, the Downtown Overlay (DO) designation was not included on the posting. Mr. Meserve reported that the DO designation was in the recent legal notice in the newspaper and on the red public hearing signs on each property under consideration.

Chair Wimmer reported for the record there was no public comment.

Commissioner Winslow moved to forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission and City Council of approval for 20-ZN-2003/6HP-2003, Sugar Bowl Historic Property Overlay: request by the City of Scottsdale, applicant, Jaclyn H. Krawczyk, Margery H. Morton, Frederick R. Huntress, and Northern Trust Bank, N.A., Trustee, owners to rezone from Central Business District Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO) to Central Business, Downtown Overlay Historic Property (C-2 DO HP) on .13± acre parcel located at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road. Second by Commissioner Johnson.

The motion passed by a vote of seven (7) to zero (0).

19-ZN-2003/5HP-2003, Pink Pony Restaurant Historic Preservation Property Overlay Zoning: request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Charles W. Briley Revocable Trust (Gwen Briley), owner, to rezone from Central Business District Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO) to Central Business, Historic Property Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO HP) on an .2± acre parcel located at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road.

Chair Wimmer reported for the record there was no public comment.

Commissioner Hartz moved to forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission and City Council of approval for 19-ZN-2003/5-HP-2003, Pink Pony Restaurant Historic Preservation Property Overlay Zoning: request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Charles W. Briley Revocable Trust (Gwen Briley), owner, to rezone from Central Business District Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO) to Central Business, Historic Property Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO HP) on an .2± acre parcel located at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road. Second by Commissioner Dallett.

The motion passed by a vote of six (6) to one (1) with Commissioner Gonzales dissenting.

Commissioner Gonzales stated the reason for his dissenting vote is because this is not the original location of the Pink Pony and he felt there have been too many changes. In his opinion, it does not conform to the HP guidelines.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

Potential Downtown Collections/Districts on Main Street and 5th Avenue

Ms. Abele requested comments on 3/25 Special Meeting scheduled for a tour of the historic districts and discussion of integrity considerations and boundaries.

Chair Wimmer commented that, to some extent, this would seem like a task of the Historic Register Committee. Ms. Abele explained that the Historic Register Committee has reviewed the potential downtown districts and given the Commission their recommendations.

The Commission reviewed the South Side of Main Street Collection of post war downtown development. It was noted that the logical way to set boundaries is by complete block frontages. It was decided previously that the north side of the street had too many alterations. The Commission discussed all of the south side of Main Street, from Marshall Way to Scottsdale Road.

Mr. Meserve noted that City Council has just approved a fee waiver program for façade improvements in the downtown and to waive fees for residential improvements in the southern neighborhoods. Downtown owners could change covered walkways or make other improvements to downtown storefronts as a result of the fee waivers.

The Commission commented on the improvements that have already been made to the storefronts. The Commission noted that some of the alterations could be looked at as part of the evolutionary process and they could develop criteria that says, if the alterations were consistent with the evolution, that could help that small stretch or area on the west end of the block for fear that if they left that area out it could be modified in a way that would not go with the rest of the street. Ms. Abele reported they could carefully write the design guidelines.

Commissioner Gonzales stated he had a strong belief that when information gets out about the historic designation people would chose to be part of the designation because he felt the retail community has a sense of unity.

Commissioner Dallett commented that she felt that it might be shortsighted at this point not to look at the entire street. The consensus of the Commission was for the boundaries to include the properties on the south side of the block as presented in the collage of photos by staff.

Ms. Abele reported staff can do research on the dates of building alterations once the Commission has determined the boundary.

The Commission reviewed the Fifth Avenue Collection of post war downtown development. The Commission discussed the characteristics of the buildings. It was noted that the 5th Avenue collection is possibly the best intact 1950's downtown in Arizona because most are gone and have been redeveloped. The Commission also discussed where they felt the boundaries should be along 5th Avenue between Goldwater Boulevard and Scottsdale Road. The Commission discussed not including the clock tower within the 5th Ave. district but look at it for individual recognition.

The consensus of the Commission was for the boundaries would go from 7079 East 5th Avenue to the southeast corner of Marshall Way to 5th Avenue with the clarification that staff would clarify the exact addresses to be included in the study boundary if needed.

Ms. Abele reported that earlier today they received approval to increase Liz Wilson's hours spent on Scottsdale research for the next couple of months till the end of the fiscal year. Ms. Abele reported that staff has already received direction from the Commission on the third collection, the Pima Plaza Collection and are moving forward.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Historic Register Committee

Commissioner Howard stated the Historic Register Committee has scheduled a meeting for Monday April 12, 2004 to review the survey findings for the 1950's multi-family complexes.

Education Outreach Committee

Commissioner Hartz reported the next Education Outreach Committee meeting is scheduled for April 20, 2004. The committee will discuss; 1) an information flier for residential historic districts, 2) a series of brochures focusing on the properties that have been designated, 3) continued discussion on community forums, and 4) trying to find ways to make their website more user friendly.

COMMISSION ITEMS

Commissioner Johnson stated the Noriega buildings are gone and the parking garage is being built. She inquired about the status of the kiosk to recognize Harvey Noriega. Mr. Meserve stated that city staff is working on a commemorative monument but he did not have details. Commissioner Johnson requested an update at a future meeting.

Commissioner Gonzales requested an update on the street improvements being planned on the easement on Cattle Track that is designated HP. Mr. Meserve stated that there are capital project improvements being planned along McDonald Drive but the plans have been revised because people in this area don't want the improvements because it is their desire to keep the rural character. Staff will provide updated information to the Commission at the next meeting.

Commissioner Johnson stated there was a newspaper article regarding a group cleaning up the Taliesin property and removing structures built by students. Mr. Meserve stated staff would provide an update at the next meeting.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Ms. Abele stated the Commission had planned on meeting April 29th at 6:00 p.m., for a tour of the Reata Pass area, but they need to schedule a work session/public hearing for the Hotel Valley Ho instead. It was determined that because the Commission already prepared to meet at 6:00 they keep that hour and date open. It was decided the Reata Pass tour would be rescheduled for May 27th.

Meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters